

Reviewer's report

Title: Health impact assessment of particulate pollution in Tallinn using fine spatial resolution and modelling techniques

Version: 3 **Date:** 12 September 2008

Reviewer: Michal Krzyzanowski

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

ad 1 - OK

ad 2 - The present text is still wrong. EU Directive 99/30/EC is referring to ambient levels of pollutants, not to emission ceilings. The text should be as follows: "If the currently agreed policies related to the emission reductions of PM and its precursors were fulfilled, the average life expectancy would increase by 2.3 months in Europe by 2020 (13)"

ad 3 - the reference level for estimation of impacts of long term exposure to PM_{2.5} is still not clearly provided (i.e. the "excess exposure" is not defined. The authors should clearly write "The minimal modelled value for areas outside the borders of Tallin (0.43 ug/m³) was considered to represent the background level captured by the model and was subtracted from the estimated PM_{2.5} in all areas to calculate the excess long-term exposure level."

ad 4 - OK

ad 5 - ok

Minor Essential comments

Most replies are OK.

Re the correction on page 14 (now - top para on page 17) - replace "threshold" by "reference concentration"

Current page 18, 3rd para, 4 line - replace "thou" by "though"

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'