

Reviewer's report

Title: Assessment and prevention of acute health effects of weather conditions in Europe. The PHEWE project: background, objectives, design

Version: 1 **Date:** 19 October 2006

Reviewer: Mathilde Pascal

Reviewer's report:

General

This article is a general overview of the European project PHEWE and do not detailed the method and results used in the different sub-project. It should be published to introduce more detailed articles focusing on each of the studies quoted in this article : temperature -mortality and morbidity relationship, HHWWS, health impact assessment, public health actions.

The discussion could be further developed to focus on the organisation of the project and on its outcomes, especially regarding the discussion on the HHWWS and on the policy and preventive actions.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

In the background chapter, data on cold impact should be added. There is a large discussion of the impact of the heat but nothing about cold. Regarding heat impact, the population at-risk should be checked to add workers and infants.

In the methods: why using maximal apparent temperature for all cities, and mean apparent temperature for Barcelona?

Exposure modeling: results of previous studies are quoted, without giving the reference.

HHWWS: the objectives of the HHWWS are not stated. Therefore, it is meaningless to speak of a warning system. Please state clearly the objectives of the system that was developed.

Discussion: the discussion on the interest of standardized protocol for HHWWS is unclear.

References:

Additional references that can be of interest:

Impact of the 2003 heatwave on all-cause mortality in 9 French cities. Le Tertre A, Lefranc A, Eilstein D, Declercq C, Medina S, Blanchard M, Chardon B, Fabre P, Filleul L, Jusot JF, Pascal L, Prouvost H, Cassadou S, Ledrans M. Epidemiology. 2006 Jan;17(1):75-9.

The Relation Between Temperature, Ozone, and Mortality in Nine French Cities During the Heat Wave of 2003
Laurent Filleul, Sylvie Cassadou, Sylvia Médina, Pascal Fabres, Agnès Lefranc, Daniel Eilstein, Alain Le

Tertre, Laurence Pascal, Benoit Chardon, Myriam Blanchard, Christophe Declercq, Jean-François Jusot, H  l  ne Prouvost, and Martine Ledrans
Environ Health Perspect. 2006 September; 114(9): 1344–1347. Published online 2006 June 22. doi:
10.1289/ehp.8328.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.