

Reviewer's report

Title: Between-airport heterogeneity in air toxics emissions associated with individual cancer risk thresholds and population risks

Version: 2 Date: 27 January 2009

Reviewer: Jouni T Tuomisto

Reviewer's report:

The paper studies two methods for estimating individual or population risk indicators for airport emissions, namely the de minimis individual risk emission threshold (DMIRET) and the intake fraction (iF), respectively. The objectives are to estimate the magnitude of these two indicators for different airports in the US, and to study such determinants of the indicators that could easily be obtained from public information sources. This is an important topic as an environmental health hazard, and as a method for providing useful information for societal decision-making.

1. Is the question posed by the authors new and well defined? YES
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described, and are sufficient details provided to replicate the work? YES
3. Are the data sound and well controlled? YES
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? YES
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? YES
6. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? YES
7. Is the writing acceptable? YES

Major Compulsory Revisions: NONE

Minor Essential Revisions: NONE

Discretionary Revisions: NONE

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.